

Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation

Meeting Minutes

January 12, 2021

The Public Hearing of the Commission for Historical and Architectural Preservation (CHAP) commenced at 1:05 PM on January 12, 2021. *This hearing was held virtually due to COVID-19.*

1. **ROLL CALL** – This meeting was chaired by Tom Liebel. Roll was called and the following commissioners were in attendance:

	Present	Absent
Tom Liebel	X	
Ann Powell	X	
Aaron Bryant	X	
Jill Dennis	*	
Laura Penza	X	
John Bullock	X	
Larry Gibson		X
Anath Ranon	X	
Matthew Mosca	X	
Jim French	X	
Kate Edwards	X	
Monica Rhodes		X

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR December 8, 2020**

Motion made by:		Aaron Bryant			
Seconded by:		Ann Powell			
Commission Vote: Approve					
		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel	-	-	-	-
Ann	Powell	X			
Aaron	Bryant	X			
Jill	Dennis	*			
Laura	Penza	X			
John	Bullock	X			
Larry	Gibson				X
Anath	Ranon	X			
Matthew	Mosca	X			
Jim	French	X			
Kate	Edwards	X			
Monica	Rhodes				X
	Total				

3. CONSENT AGENDA – 44 South Carlton St. (Union Square Historic District)

Request:	Construct Rear Addition
Petitioner:	Commserv LLC; CD 44 Carlton LLC (owner)
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Approval of plans with final details to be approved by staff
Motion made by:	Ann Powell
Seconded by:	Councilman Bullock
Motion:	Move Consent agenda

Tom	Liebel
Ann	Powell
Aaron	Bryant
Jill	Dennis
Laura	Penza
John	Bullock
Larry	Gibson
Anath	Ranon
Matthew	Mosca
Jim	French
Kate	Edwards
Monica	Rhodes
	Total

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
-	-	-	-
X			
X			
*			
X			
X			
			X
X			
X			
X			
			X

4. 733 West Pratt Street (Ridgely's Delight Historic District)

Request:	Final Review - Construct Five-Story Building Set-back Behind Retained Historic Facades
Petitioner:	Zahlco Development, LLC (prospective owner)
Staff Presenter:	Caitlin Audette
Staff Recommendation:	Final Approval with conditions
Additional Speakers:	Yonah Zahler (prospective owner); Al Barry (consultant); Deb O'Neill (neighbor)
Motion made by:	Anath Ranon
Seconded by:	Aaron Bryant
Motion:	Approve Staff Recommendation

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel	-	-	-	-
Ann	Powell	X			
Aaron	Bryant	X			
Jill	Dennis	*			
Laura	Penza	X			
John	Bullock	X			
Larry	Gibson				X
Anath	Ranon	X			
Matthew	Mosca	X			
Jim	French	X			
Kate	Edwards	X			
Monica	Rhodes				X
	Total	8			

5. 507 S. Durham Street (Fells Point Historic District)

Request:	Concept Review- Construct 4-story infill rowhouse with double-garage front
Petitioner:	Carballo Architecture (architect); Lindsay and Andrew Crummey (owners)
Staff Presenter:	Eddie Leon
Staff Recommendation:	Disapproval of proposal as submitted with a request that the applicant come back to the commission with the following revisions: Removal of the fourth story so the height and massing is compatible with surrounding structures; removal of the two-car garage door as it does not meet the CHAP guidelines
Additional Speakers:	Adam Carballo (architect); Andrew Crummey (owner); Marianne Brodnicki (neighbor)
Motion made by:	Laura Penza
Seconded by:	Matthew Mosca
Motion:	Disagree with staff recommendation, and approve the fourth floor addition because it is not visible from the public right-of-way and approval of the double garage on the first floor because of the historic precedent of the historical uses of alleys for carriage houses and garages, and the use of carriage house-style garage doors.

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel	-	-	-	-
Ann	Powell		X		
Aaron	Bryant	X			
Jill	Dennis				*
Laura	Penza	X			
John	Bullock	X			
Larry	Gibson				X
Anath	Ranon	X			
Matthew	Mosca	X			
Jim	French	X			
Kate	Edwards	X			
Monica	Rhodes				X
	Total	7	1		3

6. 814 Park Avenue (Mount Vernon Historic District)

Request:	Concept Review - Construct three story apartment building on rear of property
Petitioner:	Carballo Architecture (architect); Mirza Baig (owner)
Staff Presenter:	Caitlin Audette
Staff Recommendation:	Concept approval with final design to return to staff
Additional Speakers:	Adam Carballo (architect); Joe Harrison (neighbor)
Motion made by:	Aaron Bryant
Seconded by:	Anath Ranon
Motion:	Move staff recommendation, with further recommendation to adjust the pedestrian and garage door openings on the first floor.

Tom	Liebel
Ann	Powell
Aaron	Bryant
Jill	Dennis
Laura	Penza
John	Bullock
Larry	Gibson
Anath	Ranon
Matthew	Mosca
Jim	French
Kate	Edwards
Monica	Rhodes
	Total

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
-	-	-	-
X			
X			
			*
			X
X			
			X
X			
X			
			X
7			3

7. 3502 Cedardale Road (Ashburton Point Historic District)

Request:	Concept Review - Construct two-story detached house
Petitioner:	Vadim Bakaev, Dreamhouse LLC
Staff Presenter:	Eddie Leon
Staff Recommendation:	Approval of the height, massing and scale as the plans meet the CHAP Guidelines for new construction. Staff recommends that the applicants: Consider raising the ground floor level 2 to 3 feet so that the overall height matches the two side neighbors cornice level line, and Final plans return to staff.
Additional Speakers:	Vadim Bakaev (owner); John Crew (Ashburton Community Association President); Laurence Campbell (neighbor)
Motion made by:	Jim French
Seconded by:	Aaron Bryant
Motion:	Move staff recommendation.

Tom Liebel
 Ann Powell
 Aaron Bryant
 Jill Dennis
 Laura Penza
 John Bullock
 Larry Gibson
 Anath Ranon
 Matthew Mosca
 Jim French
 Kate Edwards
 Monica Rhodes
Total

For	Against	Abstain	Absent
-	-	-	-
X			
X			
*			
			X
X			
			X
X			
X			
X			
			X

8. 223 East Churchill Street (Federal Hill Historic District)

Request:	Concept Review - Construct rear/rooftop addition with front deck/balcony
Petitioner:	Jim Shetler, Trace Architects; Andrew Germek (owner)
Staff Presenter:	Walter Gallas
Staff Recommendation:	Disapproval with recommendation to redesign to further reduce visibility of addition and deck at front elevation
Additional Speakers:	Andrew Germek, owner; Jim Shetler, architect;
Motion made by:	Anath Ranon
Seconded by:	Matthew Mosca
Motion:	Approve staff recommendation.

		For	Against	Abstain	Absent
Tom	Liebel	-	-	-	-
Ann	Powell	X			
Aaron	Bryant	X			
Jill	Dennis				X
Laura	Penza				X
John	Bullock	X			
Larry	Gibson				X
Anath	Ranon	X			
Matthew	Mosca	X			
Jim	French	X			
Kate	Edwards	X			
Monica	Rhodes				X
	Total	7			4

Adjourn: 3:17 PM